



Vermont



Governor's Commission on Climate Change

www.vtclimatechange.us

DRAFT MEETING SUMMARY

**Vermont Governor's Commission on Climate Change Technical Working Group
Energy Supply and Demand**

Call #8, June 7, 2007, 1:30 – 3:30 pm

Prepared by Sivan Kartha and Jeff Merrell

Attendance:

TWG MEMBERS
Debra Baslow
Alan Betts
Don Gilbert
Thomas Jagielski
Dale Rocheleau
ADDITIONAL PARTICIPANTS / ALTERNATES
Riley Allen
David Lamont
VERMONT DEC
Jeff Merrell
FACILITATORS
Sivan Kartha
Energy TWG Members not present
Gina Campoli
Paul Comey
Sean Cota
Elizabeth Courtney
Richard Cowart
Robert DeGeus
Robert Dostis
Chris Dutton
Michael Dworkin
David Epstein
David Hill
James Moore
David O'Brien



www.vtclimatechange.us

Background documents:

Unless otherwise noted, all documents are posted at

http://www.vtclimatechange.us/technical_work_groups.cfm,

(Click on Energy Supply and Demand under Technical Working Groups in the left-hand column)

1. Meeting Notice and Agenda, ESD TWG Call #8
2. Summary of Call ESD TWG Call #7 (April 30, 2006)
3. Powerpoint Presentation to ES TWG Call #8

Agenda:

1. Call to order, roll call, and approval of prior meeting summary
2. Discussion of draft policy descriptions and analysis
3. Agenda, date and time for next meeting
4. Call to the public
5. Announcements

Discussion and decisions:

1. Call to order, roll call, approval of summary.

The meeting was called to order by Sivan Kartha shortly after 1:30pm, and roll call was taken. The summary of ESD TWG call #7 was approved by the group.

2. Review and discussion of priority option descriptions

Option #	Option Name
ESD-1	Evaluation and continuation / expansion of existing DSM for electricity and natural gas
ESD-2	Evaluation and expansion of DSM to Other Fuels
ESD-3	Building Efficiency Codes, Training, Tracking
ESD-4	Evaluate Potential for Contracting Nuclear Power
ESD-5	Support for Combined Heat and Power
ESD-6	Incentives and/or Mandate for Renewable Electricity*
ESD-7	GHG Cap & Trade and/or GHG tax
ESD-8	Incentives for Clean Distributed Technologies for Electricity or Heat
ESD-9	Wind-specific support measures
ESD-10	Hydro-specific support measures

Sivan presented the analytical approach for quantification to the TWG for approval, and provisional quantification results of the ESD options for comments.



www.vtclimatechange.us

(See slide presentation for further details.) Specific points that were raised by TWG members include the following.

ESD-1:

For both this option and the next, the GDS study is the basis of the analytical and technological assumptions. Riley pointed out that it may be optimistic to take the GDS study's technical potential as the ESD-1 target, but also noted that it is conservative to assume existing technological performance reflected in the GDS savings. The total cost (~\$0.05/kWh) was compared to the Efficiency Vt figure of ~\$0.036/kWh (which also includes social benefits that are not included in the GDS study.)

ESD-2, 3:

Noting that the majority of ESD-2 options are building shell related, they will be quantified in combination with ESD-3. The policies will still be described separately, as measures related to building codes and standards are a necessary step beyond the DSM measures of ESD-2 in order to make it possible to achieve the full technical potential of the GDS study. RA also pointed out that the Plenary Group requested further elaboration of the institutional aspects of this policy.

Action: *RA will think about our use of the GDS technical potential targets, and will relate any useful information obtained from Dick Spellman (GDS) on this issue.*

ESD-4:

The TWG decided that there is not enough basis to set a reliability premium at \$1/MWh for nuclear power, nor to quantify a discount for nuclear power relative to purchases (especially given that purchases need not be spot market, but could be long-term contracts given the fact that Vt sector is composed of integrated utilities).

Action: *eliminate \$1/MWh charge, and include text explaining that the total cost could be negative.*

It was also pointed out that this measure should not refer specifically to VY, but nuclear energy in general, as it is possible that the most viable solutions would involve other generation facilities as well.

Action: *ensure the text refers generally to nuclear generally, rather than specific facilities.*

ESD-6

Riley Allen explained that the marginal emissions rate used in DPS analyses is assumed for the next 1-5 years to be the emissions rate of the marginal units (which are fossil 85% of the time), and taken as a new NGCC unit for beyond 5 years. This is quite comparable to the avoided emissions factor used in this analysis.



www.vtclimatechange.us

ESD-7

The GHG tax will be quantified once the other options are quantified. The design goal will be to raise sufficient revenue to cover certain of the costs of the other measures. (For example, the administrative costs of ESD-1, ESD-2.)

ESD-8:

Cost still need to be assessed, based on information provided by Don Gilbert.

Action: Sivan and Don discuss remaining information requirements.

ESD-10

The specific reference to HQ is not necessary, as this measure refers to existing large-scale hydro generally.

Action: Ensure text refers generally to large-scale hydro.

Sivan will distribute revisions of policy descriptions and analysis for TWG input. Any input received by Thursday June 14 will be incorporated into documents posted for Plenary meeting #6 on Thursday June 21.

3. Agenda and date of next meeting

The date for the next scheduled TWG meeting is:

Friday, June 29, 2007 from 1:30 - 3:30.

The tentative agenda for the next Energy TWG is:

1. Call to order, roll call, and approval of prior meeting summary
2. Discussion of draft policy descriptions and analysis
3. Agenda, date and time for next meeting
4. Call to the public
5. Announcements

4. Public statements

There were no statements from members of the public.

5. Announcements

There were no announcements.

Sivan Kartha (skartha@sei-us.org; 617-627-3786)

Bill Dougherty (billd@sei-us.org; 617-627-3786)

Randy Strait (randy.strait@pechan.com; 919-493-3144x118)

Ken Colburn (kcolburn@symbioticstrategies.com); 617-784-6975)

Jeff Merrell (jeff.merrell@state.vt.us; 802-241-3859)